

Tropical Rock Lobster Working Group

TRLWG 4 Meeting Record

27-28 August 2015

Thursday Island

Note all meeting papers and records are available on the AFMA and PZJA webpages:

www.afma.gov.au

www.pzja.gov.au



Australian Government

Australian Fisheries Management Authority

Contents

Meeting Participants	3
Recommendations	4
Action Items	4
Agenda Item 1 - Preliminaries	5
1.1 Apologies	5
1.2 Adoption of Agenda.....	5
1.3 Ratification of Meeting Record from TRLWG 3	5
1.4 Action Items from TRLWG Meeting No. 3	5
1.5 Correspondence	6
Agenda Item 2 – Updates	7
2.1 PZJA Forums.....	7
2.2 Native Title.....	7
Agenda Item 3 – TRL Management Plan	7
3.1 Purpose and Scope	7
3.2 Community Consultation Outcomes.....	7
Agenda Item 4 – Notional Total Allowable Catch for 2015/16.....	10
Agenda Item 5 – Revising the TRL Harvest Strategy	11
Agenda Item 6 – Australia and PNG Bilateral Meeting	11
Agenda Item 7 – 12 Month Free Diving Season	11
Agenda Item 8 – Research and Data	12
8.1 Outcomes of the RAG	12
8.2 TRL Research Priorities.....	12
8.3 2014/15 Catch and Effort Update	13
Agenda Item 9 - Other Business	13

Meeting Participants

Name	Role	Declared Interest	Dates Attended
Andy Bodsworth	A/g TRLWG Chair	Fisheries research	27 & 28 August 2015
Selina Stoute	AFMA Member	None	27 & 28 August 2015
Dean Pease	AFMA, Executive Officer	None	27 & 28 August 2015
Darren Dennis	CSIRO Scientific Member	Fishery research	27 & 28 August 2015
Tom Roberts	QDAF Member	None	27 & 28 August 2015
Les Pitt	Industry Member	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Terrence Whap	Industry Member	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Aaron Tom	Industry Member	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Mariana Nahas	TSRA Member	None	27 & 28 August 2015
Phillip Ketchell	Industry Member	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Ray Moore	Industry Member	TVH licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Mark Dean	Industry Member	TVH licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Mark David	Industry Member	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Observers			
Kenny Bedford	TSRA Fisheries Portfolio Member	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Ian liviko	PNG NFA Observer	None	27 & 28 August 2015
Brett Arlidge	Industry Observer	MG Kailis	27 August 2015
Kevin Sabatino	Industry Observer	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015
Graham Hirakawa	Industry Observer	TIB licence holder	27 & 28 August 2015

Recommendations

5. The TRLWG recommended

- moon-tide closures be reintroduced in 2016 and until a management plan was implemented for TRL;
- a work-plan be developed to prioritise issues raised during community consultation visits to ensure matters are addressed. A TRLWG work-plan was discussed at **Agenda Item 9, Other Business**;
- a preliminary recommended biological catch (RBC) (lower 75th percentile) of 568t for the 2016 season;
- CSIRO revises the preliminary TAC allocation of 568t with results from the pre-season survey to be conducted in November 2015;
- the TRLRAG and Working Group meet by teleconference to discuss the outcomes of the revised recommended biological catch (RBC) for the 2016 season by 20 December 2015;
- if the seasonal ban for free-dive and lamp fishing is to be removed the TRLRAG and TRLWG should review the measure one year after its implementation;
- TRLRAG and TRLWG industry members and observers interested in participating in the workshop contact the AFMA Office 4069 1990 or Darren Dennis from CSIRO on Darren.Dennis@csiro.au.

Action Items

1. AFMA review the licencing provisions for PNG cross endorsed vessels (relating to a prohibition on fishing 'home reefs') post implementation of the TRL Management Plan.
2. AFMA review the implementation and enforcement of fish receiver licences as part of a 2016 licencing review.
3. TSRA continue progressing community consultations for the development of a roadmap to 100 per cent traditional ownership.
4. TRLWG members to provide comments on TSSAC Annual Operational Plan TRL Research Priorities.
5. In response to the Malu Lamar submission on the draft management plan, AFMA to investigate options to include performance measures relating to the objective of 100 per cent traditional ownership objective in final draft management plan.
6. CSIRO provide written advice on the likely costs and procedures required to contract industry divers to assist with TRL research surveys. This advice should include the likely cost to integrate industry collected data into the overall survey data.
7. QDAF to prepare a timeline detailing the history of TIB licencing arrangements for the TRL Fishery and provide it to the TRLWG out-of-session (OOS).
8. AFMA circulate advice to the TRLWG members and observers detailing the TRL Fishery boundary.

Agenda Item 1 - Preliminaries

1.1 Apologies

Apologies were received from Anne Clark (chair), Maluwap Nona (Malu Lamar RNTBC observer) and Luke Dillon (industry member).

1.2 Adoption of Agenda

The TRLWG **adopted** the agenda.

1.3 Ratification of Meeting Record from TRLWG 3

The TRLWG **ratified** the record of TRLWG 3 as a true and accurate record of the meeting, noting that not all members were present at the 3rd Meeting of the TRLWG. Members noted that future meeting records would be finalised within weeks of the meeting out-of-session

1.4 Action Items from TRLWG Meeting No. 3

The TRLWG was updated on action items from TRLWG 3 as detailed in the meeting paper. The following verbal updates were provided at the meeting:

Action Item 5 Moon tide closures

The Working Group noted that moon tide closures were implemented in 2015 and that there was no decision to continue the measure in 2016. The Working Group noted that moon-tide closures:

- can negatively impact market prices by causing pulse fishing. Market prices can be driven down when product is landed in bulk at set times;
- do not always align with peak tidal flows which further restricts fishing effort; and
- are not required to protect stock sustainability. The stocks are not overfished or subject to overfished and the nominal TAC generally remains under caught.

The Working Group noted however that moon-tide closures provide an economic opportunity for TIB fishers by reducing competition with the TVH sector and **recommended** that:

- Moon-tide closures be reintroduced in 2016 and until a management plan was implemented for TRL.

The Working Group noted that under quota management, moon-tide closures would no longer be necessary.

Action item 8 non-Traditional Inhabitants suppling vessels to Traditional Inhabitants

The QDAF Member confirmed vessel ownership is proven through vessel registration. Ownership may only be challenged on the basis that a person is acting under the direction of someone else. The QDAF Member noted the issue of ownership relates more to resource sharing within the TIB sector.

The Working Group noted that private sector partnerships are part of standard business practise and can be used to overcome business challenges, for example capital shortfalls. Some members remained concerned that these types of arrangements can undermine the ownership aspirations of the community.

Action Item 10 and 11 Register of Master Fisherman Licence holders and training

The TSRA Portfolio Member provided the following update:

- due to privacy laws, the contact details of TIB Master Fishermen Licence (MFL) holders could not be published on a public register;
- Transferrable Vessel Holder (TVH) primary vessel licence holders should contact MyPathway and register their interest to employ TIB MFL holders; and
- MyPathway program is developing a school leavers program which is likely to include training relevant to the fishing industry.

The Working Group noted that an opt-in system for a skills register should be considered by MyPathway.

Action Item 12 Increase boat limit from 9.9m to 13.9m

The TSRA Portfolio Member advised that there had been no consultation with communities regarding primary vessels limited to 9.9m being increased to 13.9m since TRLWG Meeting No. 3.

The TRLWG noted that this matter needed to be addressed as part of more holistic review of the Boat Replacement Policy and agreed to include it as part of its work plan (Agenda Item 9, Other Business, Table 3).

Action Item 13 Align the fishing season with international markets

The TSRA Portfolio Member advised that there had been no consultation with communities about changing the current season dates since TRLWG Meeting No. 3.

The TRLWG agreed for this matter to be included as part of its work plan (Agenda Item 9, Other Business, Table 3).

1.5 Correspondence

The TRLWG noted:

- the letter sent to Senator the Hon. Richard Colbeck Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Agriculture from Patrick Mills, Chair of the Torres Strait Fishers Association, requesting amendment to the current restriction on TIB licences for all crew to be Traditional Inhabitants;
- a response from Senator the Hon. Richard Colbeck was pending; and
- AFMA advice that, consistent with its legislative objectives the PZJA aims to minimise restrictions on business so that business can chose how best to operate.

The current crewing restriction however is designed to protect the traditional way of life and livelihood of Traditional Inhabitants and any changes to that regulation will require significant industry/community support.

Members advised that:

- consultation with industry, communities, Traditional Owners and Prescribed Body Corporates will be critical to support any changes; and
- both the TIB and TVH sector have similar difficulties employing crew.

Agenda Item 2 – Updates

2.1 PZJA Forums

The TRLWG noted the outcomes from the 24th meeting of the Protected Zone Joint Authority (PZJA) as detailed in the paper provided.

2.2 Native Title

The TRLWG noted the update on Native Title as detailed in the paper provided.

Agenda Item 3 – TRL Management Plan

3.1 Purpose and Scope

The TRLWG noted the information in the paper provided.

AFMA advised the purpose of the proposed management plan is to introduce a quota management system (QMS) for the TRL fishery and that all other rules in the fishery would be implemented as legislative instruments, licencing conditions or management policy.

The Working Group agreed to develop a work plan to systematically address other management issues in the fishery (refer to Agenda Item 9, Other Business).

3.2 Community Consultation Outcomes

The TRLWG noted:

- the community consultation outcomes on developing a plan of management as detailed in the paper provided and written submission by in Malu Lamar;
- that the meeting records of each consultation meeting had only recently been sent to each of the communities PBC Chair and the Councillor for distribution to meeting participants; and
- TIB industry members request for additional time to consult with their communities before they provide final advice on any outstanding issues with the management plan.

The TRLWG agreed that if any significant changes are made to the community consultation meeting records in response to feedback from participants, it would convene a teleconference for members to consider the changes.

The TRLWG supported the AFMA responses to community consultation outcomes (Attachments B and C) and the agreed to the following **action**:

9. In response to the Malu Lamar submission on the draft management plan, AFMA to investigate options to include performance measures relating to the objective of 100 per cent traditional ownership objective in final draft management plan.

Quota trading arrangements under a plan of management

The TRLWG noted consultation outcomes on possible quota trading arrangements to be determined under a management plan. The TRLWG agreed that trading arrangements should be developed taking into account the following considerations:

- the PZJA's decision to acknowledge and support the aspiration of 100 per cent ownership of Torres Strait Fisheries by Traditional Owners;
- the powers and functions of the *Torres Strait Fisheries Act 1984*;
- rights of existing non-traditional fishers (TVH sector) in the fishery; and
- quota leasing can be used by the TIB sector to pursue 100 percent ownership.

The TRLWG identified potential benefits and disadvantages to various trading options. These are outlined in **Table 1**.

Allocation

The TRLWG noted:

- the PZJA decision to review the quota unit allocation within the TIB sector two years after the implementation of the management plan to allow for changes, including the possible allocation to individuals and/or industry based entities;
- licencing arrangements for 'amnesty people' could be considered as part of the two year review. Some industry members advised that 'amnesty' people should be granted quota from the TVH allocation; and
- some industry observers advised that licensing arrangements should reflect the difference between fulltime and part-time TIB operators and latent effort be removed.

Roadmap to 100 percent ownership

The TRLWG noted:

- advice from some industry members that it was important for the TSRA Roadmap to 100 per cent ownership to commit to a clear timeline for achieving 100 per cent ownership; and
- advice from the AFMA member that the management plan is a tool in which the TIB sector can pursue its 100 per cent ownership aspiration. Quota trading will provide

a tool to generate revenue that could be used to facilitate the transfer of ownership. The management plan would not however, direct private sector transactions and therefore could not stipulate a timeline for the transition of ownership to the TIB sector.

Responding to issues outside of the scope of management plan

The TRLWG **recommended** the Working Group develop a work-plan to prioritise issues raised during community consultation visits to ensure matters are addressed. A TRLWG work-plan was discussed at **Agenda Item 9, Other Business**.

Table 1 Potential benefits and disadvantages to various trading options under a plan of management for the Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery.

Trading options	Potential benefits	Potential disadvantages
<p>TIB sector leasing to the TVH sector and new entrants (similar to the sunset licensing system in place for the Torres Strait Finfish Fishery).</p>	<p>Upward pressure on lease prices due to increased competition. A higher lease price will lead to increased revenue returns for the TIB sector.</p> <p>Maintenance of existing markets with a continued supply of TRL. Market access benefits all sectors in the fishery.</p> <p>Transferability is likely to support and strengthen the overall value of all licences in the fishery.</p> <p>Provides a mechanism to achieve 100 per cent ownership (generates revenue through leasing of quota to TVH sector or new entrants).</p>	<p>Increased competition from new entrants may discourage TIB participation in the fishery.</p> <p>Allowing new entrants may be viewed by some in the community as counter to aspiration of 100% ownership.</p> <p>New entrants may be less capable of working harmoniously with the TIB sector.</p>
<p>TVH sector selling and leasing to/from the TIB sector only.</p>	<p>Provides a mechanism to achieve 100 per cent ownership (through selling of licences to TIB sector).</p>	<p>Inconsistent with existing licencing conditions</p> <p>Trading restrictions are likely to undermine the licence and quota value. This in turn may impact overall market value of quota by reducing market competition.</p>

Trading options	Potential benefits	Potential disadvantages
		Trading restrictions would undermine business flexibility and therefore efficiency and value. For example, if one holder has multiple licences restricting quota trading between licences will restrict that business from managing quota across its fleet to maximise returns.
TVH sector leasing to new entrants (for example to 'sunset' licences).	<p>Maximise quota value by encouraging market competition. Market competition would benefit all sectors.</p> <p>Transferability is likely to support and strengthen the overall value of all licences in the fishery.</p>	<p>Allowing new entrants may be viewed by some in the community as counter to aspiration of 100% ownership.</p> <p>Would not raise revenue for the TIB sector.</p>

*these are not all options available

Agenda Item 4 – Notional Total Allowable Catch for 2015/16

Recommendations arising from the TRLRAG Meeting No. 14 relating to the recommended biological catch (RBC) for the 2015/16 fishing season were tabled at the meeting (**Attachment A**). Noting the TRLRAG advice the Working Group **recommended**:

- a preliminary recommended biological catch (RBC) of 704 tonnes for the 2016 season;
- CSIRO revise the preliminary TAC allocation (lower 75th percentile of the RBC) of 568t with results from the pre-season survey to be conducted in November 2015; and
- The TRLRAG and Working Group meet by teleconference to discuss the outcomes of the revised recommended biological catch (RBC) for the 2016 season.
- CSIRO to develop costed proposals for the Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery stock assessment options (**Attachment A**); and
- stock assessment options are circulated to the TRLRAG out-of-session (OOS) by mid December 2015.

Agenda Item 5 – Revising the TRL Harvest Strategy

The TRLWG noted the discussion from the TRLRAG Meeting No. 14 on the cost-catch trade-off between research/data collection investment and potential total allowable catches.

The TRLWG noted advice from the TRLRAG Meeting No. 14:

- five data/assessment options were identified for the fishery (**Attachment A**). These options could form the basis of a tiered harvest strategy;
- industry may choose to invest directly in research; and
- it was necessary to cost each data/assessment option as soon as possible as some industry members would like to explore options for directly investing in research, including a possible mid-year survey in 2016.

Agenda Item 6 – Australia and PNG Bilateral Meeting

The TRLWG noted the information in the paper provided.

PNG noted that cross endorsed licences allowing PNG vessels to fish in the Protected Zone are only issued to licence holders from the Western Province, also known as 'Treaty Village Communities'.

AFMA noted issues surrounding the cross endorsement of fishing vessels would be discussed further at the bilateral meeting.

Agenda Item 7 – 12 Month Free Diving Season

The TRLWG noted the information in the paper provided and the recommendation from the TRLRAG Meeting No. 14 that a 12 month open season for free diving and lamp fishing would pose no significant risk to the sustainability of the TRL Fishery on the basis that:

- the current size limit protects that take of 0+ and 1+ lobsters;
- the primary fishing grounds do not overlap with the likely spawning areas in the east of the Protected Zone;
- the handling of live lobsters has significantly improved overtime and the risk of post-capture mortalities due to higher water temperatures is considered a low risk; and
- the 12 month open season will enable fishers to target peak Chinese markets.

The TRLWG noted advice from the TRLRAG that:

- a one page flyer be sent to communities providing information on the minimum size limit of lobsters and the importance of only retaining legal size lobsters prior to lifting the temporal ban of free dive and lamp fishing; and
- if the temporal ban is to be removed the TRLRAG and TRLWG review the measure one year after its implementation; and

Agenda Item 8 – Research and Data

8.1 Outcomes of the RAG

The TRLWG noted the outcomes of the TRLRAG Meeting No. 14. Outcomes relating to the 2015/16 recommended biological catch (RBC) and research priorities were tabled in writing (**Attachment A**) and a verbal update was provided by the Scientific and AFMA members for all other outcomes. Refer to respective agenda Items for details (Agenda Items 4, 5, 8.1, 8.2, 8.3).

8.2 TRL Research Priorities

The TRLWG noted and supported advice from the TRLRAG Meeting No 14 and recommended the following research priorities:

- to conduct a review of empirical harvest control rules for the TRL Fishery; and
- development of a harvest strategy for the TRL Fishery which prescribes the data needs, data analysis and stock assessment procedures.

The TRLWG noted that under current budget constraints a mid-year survey was not funded for 2016 and that the research budget would likely come under further constraint. Members further noted that:

- it is open to Industry to contribute to the cost of research. The scientific member provided advice on likely investment returns, in terms of total allowable catch from a cost-catch evaluation detailed in the paper: *Dennis D et al (2015) Cost benefit of fishery-independent surveys: are they worth the money (Marine Policy 58 (2015) 108-115)*;
- options for including industry divers on CSIRO surveys had been extensively explored however workplace insurance requirements make this option unviable at this time; and
- advice from the scientific member that one potential cost saving is for industry to conduct parts of the TRL surveys. For example industry could be trained and contracted to complete survey transects. Members noted that this option should be costed to take into account any training requirements and the likely auditing regime required to use data collected by industry divers.

The TRLWG agreed to the following **action**:

6. CSIRO provide written advice on the likely costs and procedures required to contract industry divers to assist with TRL research surveys. This advice should include the likely cost to integrate industry collected data into the overall survey data.

The TRLWG noted advice from the scientific member on CSIRO's proposed industry workshop to be held in Brisbane, Queensland on 3-6 November 2015. Members agreed this was an important opportunity for industry to gain a better understanding of the stock assessment process for the fishery and **recommended** that:

- TRLRAG and TRLWG industry members and observers interested in participating in the workshop contact the AFMA Office 4069 1990 or Darren Dennis from CSIRO on Darren.Dennis@csiro.au.

8.3 2014/15 Catch and Effort Update

The TRLWG noted the information in the paper provided.

The TRLWG noted that PNG NFA will be providing AFMA with catch and effort data by method and the NFA:

- is willing to undertake future tropical rock lobster dive surveys in PNG waters to complement the research surveys undertaken in Australian waters; and
- is planning to undertake scientific surveys to gather more information on the migratory pathways of TRL in PNG waters

Members welcomed this advice noting such information is critical for underpinning effective fisheries management and that additional sampling may reduce stock assessment uncertainties.

Agenda Item 9 - Other Business

TRLWG Work plan

The TRLWG **recommended** the work-plan provided in Table 2.

Table 2. TRLWG recommended work-plan.

#	Priority	Issue
1.	High	Revision of the TRL harvest strategy. Required to support the TRL Fishery Management Plan.
2.	High	Revision of compliance arrangements to support the introduction of quota.
3.	Low	Review the licencing dates and period for TIB and TVH sector licences as part of AFMA's 2016 administrative review of licencing processes.
4.	High (post management plan)	Boat Replacement Policy review, including the option for primary vessels limited to 9.9 m presently being increased to 13.9 m.
5.	Med (post management plan)	Review arrangements for Master Fisherman Licences
6.	Med	Review the option for TIB primary vessels to be endorsed to carry any TIB registered tender at any time as part of AFMA's 2016 administrative review of licencing processes.
7.	High	TIB and TVH members to organise an industry meeting (to be held alongside a working group meeting) to

#	Priority	Issue
		develop an industry code of practice. The code of practice would cover issues include access to home reefs, hookah free zones, lamp fishing for TIB sector only, on the water behaviour (anchorage sites and rubbish disposal). This meeting will enable industry-based solutions to be developed and agreed by industry.
8.	High (post management plan)	Review fishing season dates to align with international markets.
9.	High (post management plan)	Review how/if the use of tow cages undermines boat Primary boat length restrictions.

TSRA Rangers and compliance

The TRLWG noted strong support for the ranger program and for rangers to take on fisheries compliance functions to further prevent and deter illegal fishing.

Licence history

A TIB industry observer sought clarification on the why TIB licences had no monetary value. The observer noted that historically TIBs had the same licence as the TVH sector, allowing fishing in both QLD and Torres Strait waters. It was noted that licencing arrangements have changed overtime moving to community licences and then the current TIB licences. Licences were sold and bought according to those changes. To provide further clarification, the TRLWG agreed for the following **action**:

7. QDAF to prepare a timeline detailing the history of TIB licencing arrangements for the TRL Fishery and provide it to the TRLWG out-of-session (OOS).

Area of waters

Some industry observers sought clarification on the southern boundary for the TRL Fishery. Members noted the area south of Prince of Wales Island is classified as the Queensland East Coast Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery.

The TRLWG agreed to the following **action**:

8. AFMA circulate advice to the TRLWG members and observers detailing the TRL Fishery boundary.

Other

One TIB sector industry member advised that communities do not want a quota management system (QMS) to be implemented for the TRL Fishery. The member noted that based on scientific information tabled at the recent TRLRAG meeting the stocks are in good condition and do not require further management measures. The member further

advised that allocating 44 per cent of the fishery to TVH sector contravenes the recognition of the communities' aspiration towards 100 per cent ownership of the fishery.

The AFMA member advised that AFMA took seriously the advice of industry however; it was not AFMA's view that communities opposed moving to a QMS. AFMA had completed initial consultation with all but two communities in the Torres Strait and only one community had advised that it opposed the management plan. The AFMA member reiterated that a QMS provided an opportunity to cap catches and establish an entirely new trading market that the TIB sector could participate in and actively pursue its aspiration for 100 per cent ownership. Transferability of quota is likely to support and strengthen the overall value of licences in the fishery.

RATIFIED

Attachment A

TRLRAG Recommendations – Tabled at TRLWG Meeting

Based on the results of the pre-RAG integrated stock assessment, the TRLRAG **RECOMMENDED** a preliminary TAC allocation of 568t for the 2016 season. This number represents the lower 75th percentile of the model estimated recommended biological catch (RBC) of 704t

The TRLRAG **RECOMMENDED** that CSIRO revise the assessment to incorporate the results from the pre-season survey to be conducted in November 2015 to obtain the final estimates for the RBC and TAC.

The TRLRAG **AGREED** to meet by teleconference to discuss the outcomes of the revised assessment and RBC for the 2016 season by 20 December 2015.

The TRLRAG **NOTED** a 2016 mid-year survey is not currently funded for the 2016 fishing season.

The TRLRAG **RECOMMENDED** for CSIRO and AFMA to develop costed proposals for the Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery stock assessment options (Table 1) and to circulate these to the TRLRAG out-of-session by 20 December 2015.

The TRLRAG **RECOMMENDED** the following research priorities:

- a) To conduct a review of empirical harvest control rules for the Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery.
- b) Development of a harvest strategy for the Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery which prescribes the data needs, data analysis and stock assessment procedures.

Attachment A

Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Fishery stock assessment options identified by the Torres Strait Tropical Rock Lobster Resource Assessment Group.

Data/Assessment	Need	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5
Catch and effort data from the TIB and TVH sectors	Mandatory	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓
Length frequency data from processors	Mandatory	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓
Pre-season survey	High priority for setting a total allowable catch		Annual ✓	Annual ✓	Annual ✓	
Mid-season survey	Understanding of the relative biomass		Annual ✓		Annual ✓	Annual ✓
Data summary (review of the catch per unit effort data)	Indicator for how the fishery is tracking	Annual ✓		Annual ✓	Annual ✓	
Full assessment	Setting a total allowable catch and estimate of biomass.	Every 3 years ✓	Annual ✓	Every 3 years ✓	Every 3 years ✓	Annual ✓
Harvest Control Rule	Pre-agreed decision rule for setting a total allowable catch	Annual ✓		Annual ✓	Annual ✓	

Attachment B

Summary of issues raised during community consultation visits on key management arrangements proposed under the TRL plan of management.

Location	Recommendation	AFMA comment
lama	Future Fisheries Meeting: All future meetings must be attending by all key stakeholders including: AFMA, TSRA, Torres Shire Regional Council, the Prescribed Body Corporate, fishing corporations, Malu Lamar and GBK should be represented at future fisheries meetings	Not related to the provisions of the management plan however advice noted.
lama	Development of a timeline: For future meetings there needs to be greater liaison with the community to select a time for the meeting that is suitable with fishers. It is important for TSRA to attend meetings and present the roadmap to 100 per cent ownership alongside the draft management plan. The next meeting should aim for the first week of October.	Not related to the provisions of the management plan however advice noted.
lama	Reef closures: Identify and negotiate closure mechanisms for certain areas including spring tide closures, hookah free zones, and joint access zones.	If necessary any future spatial closures would be dealt with through instruments outside of the management plan. Recommend that the Working Group add this issue to its 2016/17 work plan for consideration.
lama	Anchorage issues: The TVH sector are using certain sites for anchorage which is: disrupting traditional hunting; causing damage to seagrass beds; and displacing dugong and turtle. The community requested that AFMA address this issue as a high priority.	If necessary measures relating to protecting habitats and protected species would be dealt with through instruments outside of the management plan. Recommend the Working Group add this issue to the 2016/17 work plan for consideration.
lama	Rangers and compliance: the community questioned if there was a development program or if one could be developed for	Not related to the provisions of the management plan. TSRA is taking action to investigate

	TSRA rangers to enable them to provide a compliance role.	the feasibility and build capacity for Rangers to undertake on fisheries compliance activities in the future.
lama	Free dive season: 12 month open season of the Torres Strait tropical rock lobster for lobsters collected by free diving.	Gear restrictions are to be dealt with through instruments outside of the management plan. Refer to Table 3.
lama	Request to have Sunday as a no work day.	Temporal closures will not be dealt with by the management plan. It should be noted that any fishery closures would need to be justified in the context of the <i>Torres Strait Fisheries Act 1984</i> objectives. Further information is required from the community on the purpose of the proposed closure.
lama	TSRA and AFMA to work together in partnership with Malu Lamar and GBK to develop an entity to hold and manage quota for the TIB sector.	The PZJA has committed to reviewing the allocation provisions for the TIB sector two years after the management plan has been implemented (PZJA meeting 5 August 2015). Involvement by PZJA agencies in developing an alternate TIB allocation is yet to be determined.
lama	AFMA facilitate an overnight meeting on lama between the TVH and TIB sectors to discuss priorities and issues for both sectors, including the potential to develop a code of practice between sectors.	AFMA will advise TVH operators of the lama meeting participants proposal.
Thursday Island, Mabuig, Masig, Warraber	Application of the total allowable catch: for example, competitively across all sectors or just to the TVH sector	The PZJA has agreed for quota system to apply a TAC to the fishery with specific quota unit allocations to be made available to the TIB and TVH sectors.
Thursday Island	Interim arrangements should be applied: cap TVH, moon tide closures, licence numbers, boat number and boat length	Proposed interim arrangements relate to measures outside of the

	restrictions.	management plan
Boigu	Some participants noted concern that if there was an increase in TIB participation it may result in the TIB quota being reached before the season end and that if TACs were set too low it would be difficult for fishers to run a business.	TAC setting will be guided by a harvest strategy for the fishery. Harvest strategies provide pre-agreed decision making framework for setting TACs which will provide greater certainty for business planning.
Boigu	Councillor Dimas Toby requested another meeting with AFMA, TSRA and the Boigu community to discuss the findings of all community consultations prior to progress of PZJA or Native Title procedures leading to formal consultation.	Outcomes of the Working Group meeting will be circulated to all communities.
Cairns	An industry code of conduct to be developed.	Not related to the provisions of the management plan.
Warraber	Funds raised through leasing arrangements of the TIB sector need to be managed carefully and communities must decide how the funds are spent.	Not related to the provisions of the management plan.
Warraber	The management plan should include a review date. Participants were concern with making arrangement permanent.	The current draft provides for a review every five years. In accordance with the recent PZJA meeting (5 August 2015) the plan will also be reviewed 2 years following its implementation to improve performance including a possible allocation to individuals or companies within the Traditional Inhabitant sector.

Summary of issues raised in Malu Lamar submission on the draft management plan dated 30 January 2015.

Summary of issues raised in Malu Lamar's submission	AFMA comment
Management plan objectives	
Must include the ultimate vesting of 100% ownership of TRL resource and fishing entitlements in the native title holders	As stated by Sen. Colbeck when he met with the Torres Strait Regional Authority Board Executive, Malu Lamar representatives and industry on 1 June on Thursday Island, the management plan may be a tool through which the aspiration for 100 percent ownership of commercial access rights may be achieved. Specifically the management plan is designed to provide for the leasing of quota units. The leasing of quota units held by the Traditional Inhabitant Boat (TIB) sector to the Transferable Vessel Holder (TVH) sector may provide a source of revenue that could be used to purchase TVH licenses and quota units overtime. The PZJA agreed at its meeting on 5 August 2015 for the management plan to be reviewed two years following its implementation to allow for changes to improve performance including a possible allocation to individuals or companies within the Traditional Inhabitant sector.
Objective 5 as drafted is not specific enough.	Further clarification is required regarding specific changes recommended for objective 5.
Include a specific reference to the need for commercial fishing structure and infrastructure needed to realize TRL –related economic development.	It is beyond the scope of the management plan to direct infrastructure investment or commercial fishing structures. It is relevant however to ensure the management plan does not introduce regulations that unnecessarily impede industry developing necessary commercial structures and infrastructure.
Subject to wording being developed, an objective relating to TVH sector catch limits under the entitlements they currently hold.	The quota system proposed under the management plan will limit TVH licence holders to their quota allocations (or catch limits).
Suggested measures to achieve the 100% ownership objective	
Buy back of TVH licences overtime. For example by accessing the Indigenous Land Account.	It is beyond the scope of the management plan to direct a Government funded buyout of TVH licenses. As noted above, the management plan may facilitate the transfer of ownership through quota trading. The TSRA is developing a 'Roadmap to 100 percent

	Ownership of the Torres Strait Commercial Fisheries by Torres Strait Communities' which aims to assist in achieving the 100% ownership objective.
All new licences (including fishing licences) be only granted to Native Title holders	Under the proposed management plan the number of quota units available to the fishery will be fixed. It is currently proposed for all quota units available to the TIB sector to be granted at the sector level and for access to the TIB sector to remain open to all Traditional Inhabitants. A Traditional Inhabitant is defined by the <i>Torres Strait Fisheries Act 1984</i> .
Provide practical measures under which potential vendors of current TVH licenses can be matched with potential native title buyers.	It is beyond the scope of the management plan to match vendors and buyers of fishing licences.
Commercial arrangements involving such things as initial joint ventures between TVH license holders and native title holders with buy-out of the TVH interest over time, should be explored.	It is beyond the scope of the management plan to direct private-sector commercial agreements.
Other measures	
Provisions for monitoring catch records at regular intervals and strengthen measures around the submission of catch records.	The PZJA has the power to monitor catch records. Monitoring of catch records is an important aspect of fisheries management and AFMA is regularly, often in consultation with industry, assessing options to improve the effectiveness of such programs. As a result approaches may change or evolve over time. AFMA encourages this process to continue.
TVH catch in particular is not currently being accurately recorded. Measures are required for a central landing point required for all TVH catch (Horn Island or Thursday).	AFMA supports developing a catch monitoring system to support the proposed quota management system. These systems, including those proposed by Malu Lamar, should be developed in consultation with the TRL Working Group. One option under consideration by the TRL Working Group is to introduce a Fish Receiver system. Catch monitoring systems can be developed and continually improved overtime independent of the management plan.
Include measures to monitor catch shifting between Torres Strait and East Coast fishery.	AFMA supports working with the Queensland Government to develop strategies to monitor potential catch shifting as necessary. If necessary, management measures can be introduced by instruments outside of the management plan.
Where appropriate, catch records and buying records should be cross referenced and appropriately audited.	Cross referencing catch records where possible with buying records is a standard practice for monitoring quota managed fisheries and where appropriate will be applied in the TRL Fishery. As stated above, the

	introduction of a Fish Receiver system which will further strengthen monitoring arrangements for the fishery is under consideration.
Introduce exclusion zones for TVH operators around prescribed islands and reefs which are of particular significance to native title holders.	These types of measures require further consultation across industry and if appropriate, may be introduced by instruments outside of the management plan
Introduce measures to address issues around TVH operators accessing inhabited and uninhabited islands and certain reefs.	Noted there is existing legislation that regulates the access of inhabited and uninhabited Islands where native title has been determined.
Rubbish disposal on both islands and in seas should be addressed.	Noted there is existing legislation that regulates pollution at sea.
Maybe in the plan or elsewhere – measures to improve compliance. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Better arrangements for surveillance and enforcement action in respect to illegal fishing of TRL and other species; - More effective policing by AFMA; it must make much better use of native title holders; - Measures to ensure PNG traditional inhabitants properly comply with their entitlements. 	Compliance programs will be developed outside of the management plan. Advice from industry on native title holders will remain important for informing compliance risk assessments.